Numerical experiments on intermittent linear response and spontaneous fluctuations in off-equilibrium aging dynamics

Paolo Sibani IFK, Institut for Fysik og Kemi, SDU

Motivation

Simulation and experimenta data

Record dynamics scenario

Summary & Conclusions Numerical experiments on intermittent linear response and spontaneous fluctuations in off-equilibrium aging dynamics

> Paolo Sibani IFK, Institut for Fysik og Kemi, SDU

> > Oldenburg, 2008

◆□▶ ◆□▶ ◆□▶ ◆□▶ ▲□ ◆ ○ ◆

Numerical experiments on intermittent linear response and spontaneous fluctuations in off-equilibrium aging dynamics

Paolo Sibani IFK, Institut for Fysik og Kemi, SDU

Motivation

Simulation and experimenta data

Record dynamics scenario

Summary & Conclusions Numerical experiments on intermittent linear response and spontaneous fluctuations in off-equilibrium aging dynamics

> Paolo Sibani IFK, Institut for Fysik og Kemi, SDU

> > Oldenburg, 2008

◆□▶ ◆□▶ ◆□▶ ◆□▶ ▲□ ◆ ○ ◆

## Outline

#### ddansk Universit<mark>et</mark>

Numerical experiments on intermittent linear response and spontaneous fluctuations in off-equilibrium aging dynamics

Paolo Sibani IFK, Institut for Fysik og Kemi, SDU

Motivation

Simulation and experimenta data

Record dynamics scenario

Summary & Conclusions



2 Simulation and experimental data

3

Record dynamics scenario

al

4 Summary & Conclusions

#### ddansk Universit<mark>e</mark>i

Numerical experiments on intermittent linear response and spontaneous fluctuations in off-equilibrium aging dvnamics

Paolo Sibani IFK, Institut for Fysik og Kemi, SDU

#### Motivation

Simulation and experimental data

Record dynamics scenario

Summary & Conclusions

 After a quench, complex glassy materials (glasses, polymers spin glasses) undergo a slow change of physical properties called aging<sup>1</sup>.

◆□▶ ◆□▶ ◆□▶ ◆□▶ ▲□ ◆ ○ ◆

#### ddansk Universit<mark>e</mark>t

Numerical experiments on intermittent linear response and spontaneous fluctuations in off-equilibrium aging dynamics

Paolo Sibani IFK, Institut for Fysik og Kemi, SDU

### Motivation

Simulation and experimental data

Record dynamics scenario

Summary & Conclusions

 After a quench, complex glassy materials (glasses, polymers spin glasses) undergo a slow change of physical properties called aging<sup>1</sup>.

◆□▶ ◆□▶ ◆□▶ ◆□▶ ▲□ ◆ ○ ◆

• Age = time elapsed from the initial quench

#### ddansk Universit<mark>et</mark>

Numerical experiments on intermittent linear response and spontaneous fluctuations in off-equilibrium aging dynamics

Paolo Sibani IFK, Institut for Fysik og Kemi, SDU

### Motivation

Simulation and experimental data

Record dynamics scenario

Summary & Conclusions  After a quench, complex glassy materials (glasses, polymers spin glasses) undergo a slow change of physical properties called aging<sup>1</sup>.

◆□▶ ◆□▶ ◆□▶ ◆□▶ ▲□ ◆ ○ ◆

- Age = time elapsed from the initial quench
- Averages (energy,magnetization etc) decay slowly (power-laws or logarithms)

#### ddansk Universit<mark>et</mark>

Numerical experiments on intermittent linear response and spontaneous fluctuations in off-equilibrium aging dynamics

Paolo Sibani IFK, Institut for Fysik og Kemi, SDU

## Motivation

Simulation and experimental data

Record dynamics scenario

Summary & Conclusions

- After a quench, complex *glassy* materials (glasses, polymers spin glasses) undergo a slow change of physical properties called aging<sup>1</sup>.
- Age = time elapsed from the initial quench
- Averages (energy,magnetization etc) decay slowly (power-laws or logarithms)
- Lack of time translational invariance: the dynamics is never stationary.

ddansk Universit<mark>e</mark>i

Numerical experiments on intermittent linear response and spontaneous fluctuations in off-equilibrium aging dynamics

Paolo Sibani IFK, Institut for Fysik og Kemi, SDU

### Motivation

Simulation and experimental data

Record dynamics scenario

Summary & Conclusions In systems of biological interest the same type of non-stationary dynamics is also encountered

• Paleontological record (PS et al, PRL 1995, 1997)

ddansk Universit<mark>e</mark>t

Numerical experiments on intermittent linear response and spontaneous fluctuations in off-equilibrium aging dynamics

Paolo Sibani IFK, Institut for Fysik og Kemi, SDU

### Motivation

Simulation and experimental data

Record dynamics scenario

Summary & Conclusions

In systems of biological interest the same type of non-stationary dynamics is also encountered

- Paleontological record (PS et al, PRL 1995, 1997)
- Evolution on fitness landscapes (PS et al, Europh.Lett 1999),

ddansk Universit<mark>et</mark>

Numerical experiments on intermittent linear response and spontaneous fluctuations in off-equilibrium aging dynamics

Paolo Sibani IFK, Institut for Fysik og Kemi, SDU

### Motivation

Simulation and experimental data

Record dynamics scenario

Summary & Conclusions In systems of biological interest the same type of non-stationary dynamics is also encountered

- Paleontological record (PS et al, PRL 1995, 1997)
- Evolution on fitness landscapes (PS et al, Europh.Lett 1999),
- Tangled Nature model of evolution with individual based interactions (Hall et al, 2002, Anderson et al. 2004)

ddansk Universit<mark>et</mark>

Numerical experiments on intermittent linear response and spontaneous fluctuations in off-equilibrium aging dynamics

Paolo Sibani IFK, Institut for Fysik og Kemi, SDU

### Motivation

Simulation and experimental data

Record dynamics scenario

Summary & Conclusions In systems of biological interest the same type of non-stationary dynamics is also encountered

- Paleontological record (PS et al, PRL 1995, 1997)
- Evolution on fitness landscapes (PS et al, Europh.Lett 1999),
- Tangled Nature model of evolution with individual based interactions (Hall et al, 2002, Anderson et al. 2004)
- Social dynamics of ant populations (H.J. Jensen, personal communication, 2008)

<日 > < 同 > < 目 > < 目 > < 目 > < 目 > < 0 < 0</p>

## Macroscopic vs. mesoscopic

#### ddansk Universit<mark>e</mark>i

Numerical experiments on intermittent linear response and spontaneous fluctuations in off-equilibrium aging dynamics

Paolo Sibani IFK, Institut for Fysik og Kemi, SDU

#### Motivation

Simulation and experimental data

Record dynamics scenario

Summary & Conclusions • In the thermodynamic limit, fluctuations are unimportant and unobservable

## Macroscopic vs. mesoscopic

#### ddansk Universit<mark>e</mark>i

Numerical experiments on intermittent linear response and spontaneous fluctuations in off-equilibrium aging dynamics

Paolo Sibani IFK, Institut for Fysik og Kemi, SDU

### Motivation

Simulation and experimental data

Record dynamics scenario

Summary & Conclusions • In the thermodynamic limit, fluctuations are unimportant and unobservable

▲ロ ▶ ▲周 ▶ ▲ 国 ▶ ▲ 国 ▶ ● の Q @

• Mesoscopic systems have measurable fluctuations.

## Macroscopic vs. mesoscopic

ddansk Universit<mark>e</mark>t

Numerical experiments on intermittent linear response and spontaneous fluctuations in off-equilibrium aging dynamics

Paolo Sibani IFK, Institut for Fysik og Kemi, SDU

### Motivation

Simulation and experimental data

Record dynamics scenario

Summary & Conclusions • In the thermodynamic limit, fluctuations are unimportant and unobservable

- Mesoscopic systems have measurable fluctuations.
- Fluctuation spectra contain important dynamical information.

# Why is aging interesting

ddansk Universit<mark>et</mark>

Numerical experiments on intermittent linear response and spontaneous fluctuations in off-equilibrium aging dynamics

Paolo Sibani IFK, Institut for Fysik og Kemi, SDU

#### Motivation

Simulation and experimental data

Record dynamics scenario

Summary & Conclusions • Similar dynamical properties found across a range of complex systems motivate the search for simple unifying principles

▲ロ ▶ ▲周 ▶ ▲ 国 ▶ ▲ 国 ▶ ● の Q @

1) Bissig et al. 2003, Cipelletti & Laurence 2005

2) PS & H J Jensen 2005.

# Why is aging interesting

ddansk Universit<mark>et</mark>

Numerical experiments on intermittent linear response and spontaneous fluctuations in off-equilibrium aging dynamics

Paolo Sibani IFK, Institut for Fysik og Kemi, SDU

### Motivation

Simulation and experimental data

Record dynamics scenario

Summary & Conclusions

- Similar dynamical properties found across a range of complex systems motivate the search for simple unifying principles
- Experimental<sup>1</sup> and numerical<sup>2</sup> probes of *mesoscopic* systems link aging to intermittency & may provide detailed insights in the dynamical mechanism behind aging.

◆□▶ ◆□▶ ◆□▶ ◆□▶ ▲□ ◆ ○ ◆

- 1) Bissig et al. 2003, Cipelletti & Laurence 2005
- 2) PS & H J Jensen 2005.

## This talk

#### ddansk Universit<mark>e</mark>t

Numerical experiments on intermittent linear response and spontaneous fluctuations in off-equilibrium aging dynamics

Paolo Sibani IFK, Institut for Fysik og Kemi, SDU

#### Motivation

Simulation and experimenta data

Record dynamics scenario

Summary & Conclusions  mainly describes intermittent fluctuations of Heat flow PDF Spontaneous magnetic fluctuations Linear-response functions

- P.S. & Jesper Dall, Europhysics Lett. 64, 2003.
- P.S. & H. J. Jensen, Europhysics Lett. 69, 2005.
- P.S Europhysics Lett. 73, 2006.
- Simon Christiansen & P.S New J. of Physics, in press.

# This talk

#### ddansk Universit<mark>et</mark>

Numerical experiments on intermittent linear response and spontaneous fluctuations in off-equilibrium aging dynamics

Paolo Sibani IFK, Institut for Fysik og Kemi, SDU

### Motivation

Simulation and experimental data

Record dynamics scenario

Summary & Conclusions

- mainly describes intermittent fluctuations of Heat flow PDF Spontaneous magnetic fluctuations Linear-response functions
- A simple but general mechanism is discussed based on

- P.S. & Jesper Dall, Europhysics Lett. 64, 2003.
- P.S. & H. J. Jensen, Europhysics Lett. 69, 2005.
- P.S Europhysics Lett. 73, 2006.
- Simon Christiansen & P.S New J. of Physics, in press.

# This talk

#### ddansk Universit<mark>et</mark>

Numerical experiments on intermittent linear response and spontaneous fluctuations in off-equilibrium aging dynamics

Paolo Sibani IFK, Institut for Fysik og Kemi, SDU

### Motivation

Simulation and experimental data

Record dynamics scenario

Summary & Conclusions

- mainly describes intermittent fluctuations of Heat flow PDF Spontaneous magnetic fluctuations Linear-response functions
- A simple but general mechanism is discussed based on

- record dynamics<sup>•</sup> and subordination of aging to intermittency.
- P.S. & Jesper Dall, Europhysics Lett. 64, 2003.
- P.S. & H. J. Jensen, Europhysics Lett. 69, 2005.
- P.S Europhysics Lett. 73, 2006.
- Simon Christiansen & P.S New J. of Physics, in press.

## Aging set-up

#### ddansk Universit<mark>e</mark>



Paolo Sibani IFK, Institut for Fysik og Kemi, SDU

### Motivation

Simulation and experimental data

Record dynamics scenario

Summary & Conclusions



quench', and a field is (possibly) switched on at  $t = t_w = 100$ .

Questions:

ddansk Universit<mark>e</mark>i

Numerical experiments on intermittent linear response and spontaneous fluctuations in off-equilibrium aging dynamics

Paolo Sibani IFK, Institut for Fysik og Kemi, SDU

#### Motivation

Simulation and experimental data

Record dynamics scenario

Summary & Conclusions How do 'observables' (=averages) depend on time(s)?

▲ロ ▶ ▲周 ▶ ▲ 国 ▶ ▲ 国 ▶ ● の Q @

Average energy depends on t

Questions:

#### ddansk Universit<mark>e</mark>t

Numerical experiments on intermittent linear response and spontaneous fluctuations in off-equilibrium aging dynamics

Paolo Sibani IFK, Institut for Fysik og Kemi, SDU

#### Motivation

Simulation and experimental data

Record dynamics scenario

Summary & Conclusions How do 'observables' (=averages) depend on time(s)?

- Average energy depends on t
- Average magnetization depends on  $t_w$  and t

Questions:

#### ddansk Universit<mark>e</mark>t

Numerical experiments on intermittent linear response and spontaneous fluctuations in off-equilibrium aging dynamics

Paolo Sibani IFK, Institut for Fysik og Kemi, SDU

### Motivation

Simulation and experimental data

Record dynamics scenario

Summary & Conclusions How do 'observables' (=averages) depend on time(s)?

- Average energy depends on t
- Average magnetization depends on  $t_w$  and t
- Correlation depends on  $t_w$  and t

Questions:

#### ddansk Universit<mark>e</mark>t

Numerical experiments on intermittent linear response and spontaneous fluctuations in off-equilibrium aging dynamics

Paolo Sibani IFK, Institut for Fysik og Kemi, SDU

### Motivation

Simulation and experimental data

Record dynamics scenario

Summary & Conclusions How do 'observables' (=averages) depend on time(s)?

- Average energy depends on t
- Average magnetization depends on  $t_w$  and t
- Correlation depends on  $t_w$  and t
- Spontaneous and induced fluctuation spectra depend on  $t_w$  and t

ddansk Universit<mark>e</mark>i

Numerical experiments on intermittent linear response and spontaneous fluctuations in off-equilibrium aging dynamics

Paolo Sibani IFK, Institut for Fysik og Kemi, SDU

#### Motivation

Simulation and experimental data

Record dynamics scenario

Summary & Conclusions The Edwards Anderson spin-glass is an Ising spin model where interacting spins  $\sigma_i = \pm 1$  are placed on a lattice. The Hamiltonian is

• 
$$\mathcal{H} = \sum_{n.n.} \sigma_i \sigma_j J_{ij}$$
.

ddansk Universit<mark>et</mark>

Numerical experiments on intermittent linear response and spontaneous fluctuations in off-equilibrium aging dynamics

Paolo Sibani IFK, Institut for Fysik og Kemi, SDU

### Motivation

Simulation and experimental data

Record dynamics scenario

Summary & Conclusions

The Edwards Anderson spin-glass is an Ising spin model where interacting spins  $\sigma_i = \pm 1$  are placed on a lattice. The Hamiltonian is

- $\mathcal{H} = \sum_{n.n.} \sigma_i \sigma_j J_{ij}$ .
- For nearest neighbors  $J_{ij}$  are Gaussian standard random variables, independent for i < j

< D > < 同 > < E > < E > < E > < 0 < 0</p>

ddansk Universit<mark>et</mark>

Numerical experiments on intermittent linear response and spontaneous fluctuations in off-equilibrium aging dynamics

Paolo Sibani IFK, Institut for Fysik og Kemi, SDU

### Motivation

Simulation and experimental data

Record dynamics scenario

Summary & Conclusions The Edwards Anderson spin-glass is an Ising spin model where interacting spins  $\sigma_i = \pm 1$  are placed on a lattice. The Hamiltonian is

- $\mathcal{H} = \sum_{n.n.} \sigma_i \sigma_j J_{ij}$ .
- For nearest neighbors  $J_{ij}$  are Gaussian standard random variables, independent for i < j

◆□▶ ◆□▶ ◆□▶ ◆□▶ ▲□ ◆ ○ ◆

• The thermal equilibrium properties of the model are *complex* 

ddansk Universit<mark>et</mark>

Numerical experiments on intermittent linear response and spontaneous fluctuations in off-equilibrium aging dynamics

Paolo Sibani IFK, Institut for Fysik og Kemi, SDU

### Motivation

Simulation and experimental data

Record dynamics scenario

Summary & Conclusions

The Edwards Anderson spin-glass is an Ising spin model where interacting spins  $\sigma_i = \pm 1$  are placed on a lattice. The Hamiltonian is

- $\mathcal{H} = \sum_{n.n.} \sigma_i \sigma_j J_{ij}$ .
- For nearest neighbors  $J_{ij}$  are Gaussian standard random variables, independent for i < j
- The thermal equilibrium properties of the model are *complex*
- The time evolution, as given by a MC algorithm (Metropolis acceptance rule or equivalent) is *complex* and very similar to experimental data

# p-spin glass model

ddansk Universit<mark>et</mark>

Numerical experiments on intermittent linear response and spontaneous fluctuations in off-equilibrium aging dynamics

Paolo Sibani IFK, Institut for Fysik og Kemi, SDU

#### Motivation

Simulation and experimental data

Record dynamics scenario

Summary & Conclusions The p-spin model is an Ising spin model, The Hamiltonian is •  $\mathcal{H} = -\sum_{Plag.} \sigma_i \sigma_j \sigma_k \sigma_l$ 

◆□ ▶ ◆□ ▶ ◆ □ ▶ ◆ □ ▶ ● ● ● ● ● ●

# p-spin glass model

ddansk Universit<mark>et</mark>

Numerical experiments on intermittent linear response and spontaneous fluctuations in off-equilibrium aging dynamics

Paolo Sibani IFK, Institut for Fysik og Kemi, SDU

### Motivation

Simulation and experimental data

Record dynamics scenario

Summary & Conclusions The p-spin model is an Ising spin model, The Hamiltonian is

- $\mathcal{H} = -\sum_{Plag.} \sigma_i \sigma_j \sigma_k \sigma_l$
- The thermal equilibrium properties of the model are trivial

◆□ ▶ ◆□ ▶ ◆ □ ▶ ◆ □ ▶ ● ● ● ● ● ●

# p-spin glass model

ddansk Universit<mark>et</mark>

Numerical experiments on intermittent linear response and spontaneous fluctuations in off-equilibrium aging dynamics

Paolo Sibani IFK, Institut for Fysik og Kemi, SDU

### Motivation

Simulation and experimental data

Record dynamics scenario

Summary & Conclusions The p-spin model is an Ising spin model, The Hamiltonian is

- $\mathcal{H} = -\sum_{Plaq.} \sigma_i \sigma_j \sigma_k \sigma_l$
- The thermal equilibrium properties of the model are trivial

• The time evolution is nevertheless complex, featuring metastability and aging.

## ROM model

ddansk Universit<mark>e</mark>t

Numerical experiments on intermittent linear response and spontaneous fluctuations in off-equilibrium aging dynamics

Paolo Sibani IFK, Institut for Fysik og Kemi, SDU

### Motivation

Simulation and experimental data

Record dynamics scenario

Summary & Conclusions The Restricted Occupancy Model is a lattice model describing vortex creep in type II superconductors in terms of the number  $n_i =$  of vortices on site *i*.

• the energy includes repulsive interactions between vortex lines on neighbor sites

▲ロ ▶ ▲周 ▶ ▲ 国 ▶ ▲ 国 ▶ ● の Q @

see L. P. Oliveira et al. *Phys. Rev. B* 104526 (2005) and references therein.

## ROM model

ddansk Universit<mark>e</mark>t

Numerical experiments on intermittent linear response and spontaneous fluctuations in off-equilibrium aging dynamics

Paolo Sibani IFK, Institut for Fysik og Kemi, SDU

### Motivation

Simulation and experimental data

Record dynamics scenario

Summary & Conclusions

The Restricted Occupancy Model is a lattice model describing vortex creep in type II superconductors in terms of the number  $n_i =$  of vortices on site *i*.

• the energy includes repulsive interactions between vortex lines on neighbor sites

▲ロ ▶ ▲周 ▶ ▲ 国 ▶ ▲ 国 ▶ ● の Q @

pinning to random sites

see L. P. Oliveira et al. *Phys. Rev. B* 104526 (2005) and references therein.

## ROM model

ddansk Universit<mark>e</mark>t

Numerical experiments on intermittent linear response and spontaneous fluctuations in off-equilibrium aging dynamics

Paolo Sibani IFK, Institut for Fysik og Kemi, SDU

Motivation

Simulation and experimental data

Record dynamics scenario

Summary & Conclusions The Restricted Occupancy Model is a lattice model describing vortex creep in type II superconductors in terms of the number  $n_i =$  of vortices on site *i*.

- the energy includes repulsive interactions between vortex lines on neighbor sites
- pinning to random sites
- the configuration is updated with Metropolis dynamics

▲ロ ▶ ▲周 ▶ ▲ 国 ▶ ▲ 国 ▶ ● の Q @

see L. P. Oliveira et al. *Phys. Rev. B* 104526 (2005) and references therein.

## ROM model intermittency

ddansk Universit<mark>e</mark>t

Numerical experiments on intermittent linear response and spontaneous fluctuations in off-equilibrium aging dynamics

Paolo Sibani IFK, Institut for Fysik og Kemi, SDU

### Motivation

Simulation and experimental data

Record dynamics scenario

Summary & Conclusions



The time variation of the total number of vortices N(t) on the system for a single realization of the pinning potential and the thermal noise in a 8  $\times$  $8 \times 8$  lattice for T = 0.1.

◆□ > ◆□ > ◆三 > ◆三 > ・ 三 · のへの

# Spin-glass, heat flow intermittency

#### ddansk Universit<mark>e</mark>i

Numerical experiments on intermittent linear response and spontaneous fluctuations in off-equilibrium aging dynamics

Paolo Sibani IFK, Institut for Fysik og Kemi, SDU

### Motivation

Simulation and experimental data

Record dynamics scenario

Summary & Conclusions



Heat transfer PDF for a spin glass model (PS & H J Jensen, Europhysics Lett. 2005)

▲ロ ▶ ▲周 ▶ ▲ 国 ▶ ▲ 国 ▶ ● の Q @

transfer *H* over small time  $\delta t$  in the E-A spin glass model has a Gaussian part and an intermittent tail. Six different ages are considered with  $\delta t/t_{w} = .01$ .
### p-spin model, average energy decay

#### ddansk Universit<mark>et</mark>



Paolo Sibani IFK, Institut for Fysik og Kemi, SDU

#### Motivation

Simulation and experimental data

Record dynamics scenario

Summary & Conclusions





### Heat flow rate, p-spin model

#### ddansk Universit<mark>et</mark>



Paolo Sibani IFK, Institut for Fysik og Kemi, SDU

#### Motivation

Simulation and experimental data

Record dynamics scenario

Summary & Conclusions



of energy flow is plotted versus the age for the temperatures shown. The full line has the form  $y = C(T)t_w^{-1}$ .

## p-spin model, intermittent energy decay

#### ddansk Universit<mark>et</mark>

Numerical experiments on intermittent linear response and spontaneous fluctuations in off-equilibrium aging dynamics

Paolo Siban IFK, Institut for Fysik og Kemi, SDU

#### Motivation

Simulation and experimental data

Record dynamics scenario

Summary & Conclusions



S. Christiansen
& PS, New J. of
Physics, to appear

(日)

3

## p-spin model, quakes in real space

ddansk Universit<mark>et</mark>

Numerical experiments on intermittent linear response and spontaneous fluctuations in off-equilibrium aging dynamics

Paolo Sibani IFK, Institut for Fysik og Kemi, SDU

#### Motivation

Simulation and experimental data

Record dynamics scenario

Summary & Conclusions



S. Christiansen & PS, *New J. of Physics*, to appear

э

### p-spin model, heat flow

#### ddansk Universit<mark>et</mark>

Numerical experiments on intermittent linear response and spontaneous fluctuations in off-equilibrium aging dynamics

Paolo Siban IFK, Institut for Fysik og Kemi, SDU

#### Motivation

Simulation and experimental data

Record dynamics scenario

Summary & Conclusions



The PDF of the heat exchanged between system and thermal bath over a time  $\delta t = 100$ . T = 1.5.

◆□▶ ◆□▶ ◆□▶ ◆□▶ □ ○ ○ ○ ○

## p-spin model, magnetic fluctuations H = 0

ddansk Universit<mark>et</mark>

Numerical experiments on intermittent linear response and spontaneous fluctuations in off-equilibrium aging dynamics

Paolo Siban IFK, Institut for Fysik og Kemi, SDU

### Motivation

Simulation and experimental data

Record dynamics scenario

Summary & Conclusions



The PDF of the spontaneous magnetic fluctuations over a time  $\delta t = 100$  and T = 1.5.

## p-spin model, magnetic fluctuations H = 0.3

ddansk Universit<mark>et</mark>

Numerical experiments on intermittent linear response and spontaneous fluctuations in off-equilibrium aging dynamics

Paolo Sibani IFK, Institut for Fysik og Kemi, SDU

#### Motivation

Simulation and experimental data

Record dynamics scenario

Summary & Conclusions



The PDF of the spontaneous magnetic fluctuations over a time  $\delta t = 100$ . T = 1.5.

・ロト ・ 同ト ・ ヨト ・ ヨト

3

The magnetic response is SUBORDINATED to the quakes

# E-A spin-glass, autocorrelation function

ddansk Universit<mark>et</mark>

Numerical experiments on intermittent linear response and spontaneous fluctuations in off-equilibrium aging dynamics

Paolo Sibani IFK, Institut for Fysik og Kemi, SDU

#### Motivation

Simulation and experimental data

Record dynamics scenario

Summary & Conclusions The auto-correlation measures configurational changes occurring while the system ages Definition:  $C(t_w, t) = \frac{1}{N} \sum_i \sigma_i(t_w) \sigma_i(t + t_w)$ . For finite *N*, this is fluctuating quantity. The distribution of the fluctuations carries informations on the configurational changes induced by the quakes.

# E-A spin-glass, autocorrelation fluctuations

ddansk Universit<mark>et</mark>

Numerical experiments on intermittent linear response and spontaneous fluctuations in off-equilibrium aging dynamics

Paolo Sibani IFK, Institut for Fysik og Kemi, SDU

### Motivation

Simulation and experimental data

Record dynamics scenario

Summary & Conclusions



Scaled and shifted autocorrelation PDF (full line)& simulation data for T = 0.15, 0.25, 0.35 and 0.5.  $t/t_w = 2.3, 7.6$  and 25.6, left to right. PS, Europh. Lett.73, 2006.

## Spin-glass TRM flow

#### ddansk Universit<mark>e</mark>t

Numerical experiments on intermittent linear response and spontaneous fluctuations in off-equilibrium aging dynamics

Paolo Sibani IFK, Institut for Fysik og Kemi, SDU

#### Motivation

Simulation and experimental data

Record dynamics scenario

Summary & Conclusions



magnetization change  $\delta M$  for isothermal aging at  $T = 0.83 T_g$ . The magnetic field is cut at  $t_w = 100$ s. The sampling interval is [1000, 3000] and  $\delta t = 5 \times 1.045$ s. PS, G. Kenning and G. Rodriguez, *Phys. Rev. B* 74, 224407 (2006)

## Two types of events

ddansk Universit<mark>et</mark>

Numerical experiments on intermittent linear response and spontaneous fluctuations in off-equilibrium aging dynamics

Paolo Sibani IFK, Institut for Fysik og Kemi, SDU

Motivation

Simulation and experimental data

Record dynamics scenario

Summary & Conclusions Two types of changes characterize the evolution of aggregate variables (i.e. the energy)

• Reversible fluctuation of zero average with Gaussian PDF's

## Two types of events

ddansk Universit<mark>et</mark>

Numerical experiments on intermittent linear response and spontaneous fluctuations in off-equilibrium aging dynamics

Paolo Sibani IFK, Institut for Fysik og Kemi, SDU

Motivation

Simulation and experimental data

Record dynamics scenario

Summary & Conclusions Two types of changes characterize the evolution of aggregate variables (i.e. the energy)

• Reversible fluctuation of zero average with Gaussian PDF's

▲ロ ▶ ▲周 ▶ ▲ 国 ▶ ▲ 国 ▶ ● の Q @

• Irreversible events quakes which carry the aging drift

## Two types of events

ddansk Universit<mark>et</mark>

Numerical experiments on intermittent linear response and spontaneous fluctuations in off-equilibrium aging dynamics

Paolo Sibani IFK, Institut for Fysik og Kemi, SDU

Motivation

Simulation and experimental data

Record dynamics scenario

Summary & Conclusions Two types of changes characterize the evolution of aggregate variables (i.e. the energy)

• Reversible fluctuation of zero average with Gaussian PDF's

- Irreversible events quakes which carry the aging drift
- & produce *intermittent* tails—usually exponentials.

# Subordination of aging phenomena to the quakes

< 日 > < 同 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > <

-

ddansk Universit<mark>e</mark>

Numerical experiments on intermittent linear response and spontaneous fluctuations in off-equilibrium aging dynamics

Paolo Sibani IFK, Institut for Fysik og Kemi, SDU

Motivation

Simulation and experimental data

Record dynamics scenario

Summary & Conclusions • The quakes control the aging process:

# Subordination of aging phenomena to the quakes

ddansk Universit<mark>e</mark>i

Numerical experiments on intermittent linear response and spontaneous fluctuations in off-equilibrium aging dynamics

Paolo Sibani IFK, Institut for Fysik og Kemi, SDU

Motivation

Simulation and experimental data

Record dynamics scenario

Summary & Conclusions

- The quakes control the aging process:
- correlations and response functions and other averages *only* depend of the number *n* of quakes occurring in the observation interval.

# Subordination of aging phenomena to the quakes

ddansk Universit<mark>e</mark>i

Numerical experiments on intermittent linear response and spontaneous fluctuations in off-equilibrium aging dynamics

Paolo Sibani IFK, Institut for Fysik og Kemi, SDU

Motivation

Simulation and experimental data

Record dynamics scenario

Summary & Conclusions

- The quakes control the aging process:
- correlations and response functions and other averages *only* depend of the number *n* of quakes occurring in the observation interval.
- The de-correlation effect of equilibrium-like fluctuations is neglected in this *approximation*.

◆□▶ ◆□▶ ◆□▶ ◆□▶ ▲□ ◆ ○ ◆

## Temporal statistics of quakes

ddansk Universit<mark>e</mark>i

Numerical experiments on intermittent linear response and spontaneous fluctuations in off-equilibrium aging dynamics

Paolo Sibani IFK, Institut for Fysik og Kemi, SDU

Motivation

Simulation and experimental data

Record dynamics scenario

Summary & Conclusions • The temporal statistics of quakes can be studied empirically from signal traces

## Temporal statistics of quakes

ddansk Universit<mark>et</mark>

Numerical experiments on intermittent linear response and spontaneous fluctuations in off-equilibrium aging dynamics

Paolo Sibani IFK, Institut for Fysik og Kemi, SDU

Motivation

Simulation and experimental data

Record dynamics scenario

Summary & Conclusions

- The temporal statistics of quakes can be studied empirically from signal traces
- if one is able to identify the times  $t_1, t_2 \dots t_k$  at which the quakes 'occur'.

# E.g. the p-spin model-again

ddansk Universit<mark>et</mark>

Numerical experiments on intermittent linear response and spontaneous fluctuations in off-equilibrium aging dynamics

Paolo Siban IFK, Institu for Fysik og Kemi, SDU

Motivation

Simulation and experimental data

Record dynamics scenario

Summary & Conclusions



The distribution of the logarithmic differences  $log(t_k) - log(t_{k-1})$ . is approximately exponential.

< 日 > < 同 > < 回 > < 回 > < 回 > <

3

ddansk Universit<mark>et</mark>

Numerical experiments on intermittent linear response and spontaneous fluctuations in off-equilibrium aging dynamics

Paolo Sibani IFK, Institut for Fysik og Kemi. SDU

Motivation

Simulation and experimental data

Record dynamics scenario

Summary & Conclusions •  $P(n, t_1, t_2)$  probability that *n* quakes occur in  $[t_1, t_2)$ .

ddansk Universit<mark>et</mark>

Numerical experiments on intermittent linear response and spontaneous fluctuations in off-equilibrium aging dynamics

Paolo Sibani IFK, Institut for Fysik og Kemi, SDU

Motivation

Simulation and experimental data

Record dynamics scenario

Summary & Conclusions P(n, t<sub>1</sub>, t<sub>2</sub>) probability that n quakes occur in [t<sub>1</sub>, t<sub>2</sub>).

$$P(n, t_1, t_2) = \frac{\mu^n}{n!} \exp(-\mu) \quad \mu(t_1, t_2) = \alpha \log(t_2/t_1) \quad (1)$$

ddansk Universit<mark>et</mark>

Numerical experiments on intermittent linear response and spontaneous fluctuations in off-equilibrium aging dynamics

Paolo Sibani IFK, Institut for Fysik og Kemi, SDU

Motivation

Simulation and experimenta data

Record dynamics scenario

Summary & Conclusions P(n, t<sub>1</sub>, t<sub>2</sub>) probability that n quakes occur in [t<sub>1</sub>, t<sub>2</sub>).

$$P(n, t_1, t_2) = \frac{\mu^n}{n!} \exp(-\mu) \quad \mu(t_1, t_2) = \alpha \log(t_2/t_1) \quad (1)$$

▲ロ ▶ ▲周 ▶ ▲ 国 ▶ ▲ 国 ▶ ● の Q @

The statistics applies in MANY situations

ddansk Universit<mark>et</mark>

Numerical experiments on intermittent linear response and spontaneous fluctuations in off-equilibrium aging dynamics

Paolo Sibani IFK, Institut for Fysik og Kemi, SDU

Motivation

Simulation and experimental data

Record dynamics scenario

Summary & Conclusions P(n, t<sub>1</sub>, t<sub>2</sub>) probability that n quakes occur in [t<sub>1</sub>, t<sub>2</sub>).

$$P(n, t_1, t_2) = \frac{\mu^n}{n!} \exp(-\mu) \quad \mu(t_1, t_2) = \alpha \log(t_2/t_1) \quad (1)$$

- The statistics applies in MANY situations
- Where could it possibly come from?

# Metastability & marginal stability

ddansk Universit<mark>et</mark>

Numerical experiments on intermittent linear response and spontaneous fluctuations in off-equilibrium aging dynamics

Paolo Sibani IFK, Institut for Fysik og Kemi, SDU

Motivation

Simulation and experimental data

Record dynamics scenario

Summary & Conclusions

- Metastable attractors = attractor basins of noise-less dynamics
- Reversible, equilibrium-like fluctuations within the basins
- Large intermittent fluctuations correspond to a change of attractor
- The nature of the noise is system specific
- What would trigger a change of attractor in isothermal aging?

# Extremal (record) fluctuations

ddansk Universit<mark>e</mark>i

Numerical experiments on intermittent linear response and spontaneous fluctuations in off-equilibrium aging dynamics

Paolo Siban IFK, Institut for Fysik og Kemi, SDU

Motivation

Simulation and experimental data

Record dynamics scenario

Summary & Conclusions



 Extremal fluctuations are irrelevant in stable systems

 But can bring a metastable system 'over the stability edge' of a basin

 In a marginally stable situation, each extremal fluctuation does so

・ロト ・ 雪 ト ・ ヨ ト

-

# 'log-Poisson' distribution from record statistics

ddansk Universit<mark>e</mark>t

Numerical experiments on intermittent linear response and spontaneous fluctuations in off-equilibrium aging dvnamics

Paolo Sibani IFK, Institut for Fysik og Kemi, SDU

Motivation

Simulation and experimental data

Record dynamics scenario

Summary & Conclusions Consider a time series of independent random numbers with any continuous distribution.

A record is a number larger than all its predecessors.

• The number of records between draws  $t_1$  and  $t_2 > t_1$  is well described as a Poisson process

▲ロ ▶ ▲周 ▶ ▲ 国 ▶ ▲ 国 ▶ ● の Q @

(P.S & Peter Littlewood PRL 1993)

# 'log-Poisson' distribution from record statistics

ddansk Universit<mark>e</mark>t

Numerical experiments on intermittent linear response and spontaneous fluctuations in off-equilibrium aging dynamics

Paolo Sibani IFK, Institut for Fysik og Kemi, SDU

Motivation

Simulation and experimental data

Record dynamics scenario

Summary & Conclusions Consider a time series of independent random numbers with any continuous distribution.

A record is a number larger than all its predecessors.

• The number of records between draws  $t_1$  and  $t_2 > t_1$  is well described as a Poisson process

◆□▶ ◆□▶ ◆□▶ ◆□▶ ▲□ ◆ ○ ◆

• with average  $\log(t_2/t_1)$ 

(P.S & Peter Littlewood PRL 1993 )

## Method of analysis

ddansk Universit<mark>e</mark>t

Numerical experiments on intermittent linear response and spontaneous fluctuations in off-equilibrium aging dynamics

Paolo Sibani IFK, Institut for Fysik og Kemi, SDU

Motivation

Simulation and experimental data

Record dynamics scenario

Summary & Conclusions • Solve a Markov chain where *n* has the role of a 'time' variable. Leads to exponential decays.

## Method of analysis

ddansk Universit<mark>e</mark>t

Numerical experiments on intermittent linear response and spontaneous fluctuations in off-equilibrium aging dvnamics

Paolo Sibani IFK, Institut for Fysik og Kemi, SDU

Motivation

Simulation and experimental data

Record dynamics scenario

Summary & Conclusions

- Solve a Markov chain where *n* has the role of a 'time' variable. Leads to exponential decays.
- Average over the probability that *n* events occur within a time interval  $(t_w, t_w + t)$  This is a Poisson distribution whose average scales with  $log((t_w + t)/t_w)$ .

The average over *n* turns the exponential into power-laws.

ddansk Universit<mark>e</mark>t

Numerical experiments on intermittent linear response and spontaneous fluctuations in off-equilibrium aging dynamics

Paolo Sibani IFK, Institut for Fysik og Kemi, SDU

Motivation

Simulation and experimental data

Record dynamics scenario

Summary & Conclusions • 'spin' model. Configuration is a point in a hypercube

◆□ ▶ ◆□ ▶ ◆ □ ▶ ◆ □ ▶ ● ● ● ● ● ●

ddansk Universit<mark>e</mark>t

Numerical experiments on intermittent linear response and spontaneous fluctuations in off-equilibrium aging dynamics

Paolo Sibani IFK, Institut for Fysik og Kemi, SDU

Motivation

Simulation and experimental data

Record dynamics scenario

Summary & Conclusions

- 'spin' model. Configuration is a point in a hypercube
- Each quake overturns a random number of spins with an exponential distribution

ddansk Universit<mark>e</mark>t

Numerical experiments on intermittent linear response and spontaneous fluctuations in off-equilibrium aging dynamics

Paolo Sibani IFK, Institut for Fysik og Kemi, SDU

Motivation

Simulation and experimental data

Record dynamics scenario

Summary & Conclusions

- 'spin' model. Configuration is a point in a hypercube
- Each quake overturns a random number of spins with an exponential distribution
- All spins have the same probability to be part of a quake

ddansk Universit<mark>e</mark>t

Numerical experiments on intermittent linear response and spontaneous fluctuations in off-equilibrium aging dynamics

Paolo Sibani IFK, Institut for Fysik og Kemi, SDU

Motivation

Simulation and experimental data

Record dynamics scenario

Summary & Conclusions

- 'spin' model. Configuration is a point in a hypercube
- Each quake overturns a random number of spins with an exponential distribution
- All spins have the same probability to be part of a quake
- The number of quakes falling in certain time interval is 'log'Poisson distributed.

◆□▶ ◆□▶ ◆□▶ ◆□▶ ▲□ ◆ ○ ◆

## Autocorrelation model PDF

#### ddansk Universit<mark>e</mark>t

Numerical experiments on intermittent linear response and spontaneous fluctuations in off-equilibrium aging dynamics

Paolo Siban IFK, Institut for Fysik og Kemi, SDU

### Motivation

Simulation and experimenta data

### Record dynamics scenario

Summary & Conclusions



the model autocorrelation PDF. PS, Europh. Lett.73, 2006.

### Comparison with Gumbel description

#### ddansk Universit<mark>e</mark>i

Numerical experiments on intermittent linear response and spontaneous fluctuations in off-equilibrium aging dynamics

Paolo Sibani IFK, Institut for Fysik og Kemi, SDU

### Motivation

Simulation and experimental data

### Record dynamics scenario

Summary & Conclusions



The model see also: H. E.

PDF is compared to the best Gumbel approximation. Castillo et al., Phys. Rev. B, 68:13442, 2003

◆□ > ◆□ > ◆三 > ◆三 > ・ 三 ・ の < @ >

### Average autocorrelation

#### ddansk Universit<mark>e</mark>i

Numerical experiments on intermittent linear response and spontaneous fluctuations in off-equilibrium aging dynamics

Paolo Siban IFK, Institut for Fysik og Kemi, SDU

Motivation

Simulation and experimental data

Record dynamics scenario

Summary & Conclusions



$$\langle C \rangle = (1 + t/t_w)^{\lambda(T)};$$

and

$$\lambda(T) = -2\frac{\alpha(N)}{N}\frac{1}{q(T)}$$
#### **T**-shifts



dynamics scenario

ext. field

10<sup>5</sup>

A negative T-shift at t = 100

### Average response & effective age

#### ddansk Universit<mark>e</mark>t

Numerical experiments on intermittent linear response and spontaneous fluctuations in off-equilibrium aging dynamics

Paolo Sibani IFK, Institut for Fysik og Kemi, SDU

#### Motivation

Simulation and experimenta data

#### Record dynamics scenario

Summary & Conclusions



The average linear response (under isothermal or T-shifted conditions) versus the system age t, scaled with either the true or the effective age. The two nearly overlapping data sets are for: *i*) Isothermal response at the indicated temperature, versus the age scaled by  $t_{w. eff}$ . *(ii) T*-shifted response, plotted versus the system age scaled by  $t_{w. eff}$ . (PS & Simon Christensen, PRE 77, 041106, 2008)

### Effective age vs age & effective age

#### ddansk Universit<mark>et</mark>



Paolo Sibani IFK, Institut for Fysik og Kemi, SDU

#### Motivation

Simulation and experimenta data

#### Record dynamics scenario

Summary & Conclusions



Left: algebraic relation between the effective and the actual age for the three different *T*-shifts Full lines:  $t_{w,eff} = t_w^x$ , where *x* is determined by a least square fit. Right, symbols  $t_w^x$  versus  $t_{w,eff}$  for all available *x* value. Line prediction  $t_{w,eff} = t_w^x$  with  $x = \frac{T_{initial}}{T_{final}}$ . (PS & S. Christensen, PRE 77, 041106, 2008)

#### Data from mesoscopic systems

ddansk Universit<mark>e</mark>t

Numerical experiments on intermittent linear response and spontaneous fluctuations in off-equilibrium aging dynamics

Paolo Sibani IFK, Institut for Fysik og Kemi, SDU

Motivation

Simulation and experimental data

Record dynamics scenario

Summary & Conclusions

• experimental and numerical evidence from meso-scaled complex materials

◆□ ▶ ◆□ ▶ ◆ □ ▶ ◆ □ ▶ ● ● ● ● ● ●

### Data from mesoscopic systems

ddansk Universit<mark>e</mark>t

Numerical experiments on intermittent linear response and spontaneous fluctuations in off-equilibrium aging dynamics

Paolo Sibani IFK, Institut for Fysik og Kemi, SDU

Motivation

Simulation and experimental data

Record dynamics scenario

Summary & Conclusions

• experimental and numerical evidence from meso-scaled complex materials

▲ロ ▶ ▲周 ▶ ▲ 国 ▶ ▲ 国 ▶ ● の Q @

• for two types of events

### Data from mesoscopic systems

ddansk Universit<mark>et</mark>

Numerical experiments on intermittent linear response and spontaneous fluctuations in off-equilibrium aging dynamics

Paolo Sibani IFK, Institut for Fysik og Kemi, SDU

Motivation

Simulation and experimental data

Record dynamics scenario

Summary & Conclusions

• experimental and numerical evidence from meso-scaled complex materials

- for two types of events
- equilibrium-like fluctuations & intermittent quakes

#### Record-dynamics interpretation

ddansk Universit<mark>e</mark>

Numerical experiments on intermittent linear response and spontaneous fluctuations in off-equilibrium aging dynamics

Paolo Sibani IFK, Institut for Fysik og Kemi, SDU

Motivation

Simulation and experimental data

Record dynamics scenario

Summary & Conclusions

#### • the quakes are irreversible

◆ロト ◆御 ▶ ◆臣 ▶ ◆臣 ▶ ○臣 ○ のへで

### Record-dynamics interpretation

ddansk Universit<mark>e</mark>i

Numerical experiments on intermittent linear response and spontaneous fluctuations in off-equilibrium aging dynamics

Paolo Sibani IFK, Institut for Fysik og Kemi, SDU

Motivation

Simulation and experimental data

Record dynamics scenario

Summary & Conclusions

- the quakes are irreversible
- are triggered by extremal fluctuations within IS basins

ddansk Universit<mark>e</mark>t

Numerical experiments on intermittent linear response and spontaneous fluctuations in off-equilibrium aging dynamics

Paolo Sibani IFK, Institut for Fysik og Kemi, SDU

Motivation

Simulation and experimental data

Record dynamics scenario

Summary & Conclusions

• Marginal stability is an (entropic) effect of the overabundance of shallow basins

ddansk Universit<mark>e</mark>t

Numerical experiments on intermittent linear response and spontaneous fluctuations in off-equilibrium aging dynamics

Paolo Sibani IFK, Institut for Fysik og Kemi, SDU

Motivation

Simulation and experimental data

Record dynamics scenario

Summary & Conclusions

- Marginal stability is an (entropic) effect of the overabundance of shallow basins
- Similar energy landscapes belong to each of α(N) independently thermalized domains

ddansk Universit<mark>e</mark>t

Numerical experiments on intermittent linear response and spontaneous fluctuations in off-equilibrium aging dynamics

Paolo Sibani IFK, Institut for Fysik og Kemi, SDU

Motivation

Simulation and experimental data

Record dynamics scenario

Summary & Conclusions

- Marginal stability is an (entropic) effect of the overabundance of shallow basins
- Similar energy landscapes belong to each of α(N) independently thermalized domains
- Quakes are not scale invariant objects in real space.

ddansk Universit<mark>e</mark>t

Numerical experiments on intermittent linear response and spontaneous fluctuations in off-equilibrium aging dynamics

Paolo Sibani IFK, Institut for Fysik og Kemi, SDU

Motivation

Simulation and experimental data

Record dynamics scenario

Summary & Conclusions

- Marginal stability is an (entropic) effect of the overabundance of shallow basins
- Similar energy landscapes belong to each of α(N) independently thermalized domains
- Quakes are not scale invariant objects in real space.
- Complex behavior arises due to a self-similar structure of the energy landscape of each domain.

### Outlook

#### ddansk Universit<mark>e</mark>t

Numerical experiments on intermittent linear response and spontaneous fluctuations in off-equilibrium aging dynamics

Paolo Sibani IFK, Institut for Fysik og Kemi, SDU

#### Motivation

Simulation and experimental data

Record dynamics scenario

Summary & Conclusions

• the record dynamics scenario also apples to other non-thermal systems

◆□ ▶ ◆□ ▶ ◆ □ ▶ ◆ □ ▶ ● ● ● ● ● ●

### Outlook

#### ddansk Universit<mark>e</mark>t

Numerical experiments on intermittent linear response and spontaneous fluctuations in off-equilibrium aging dynamics

Paolo Sibani IFK, Institut for Fysik og Kemi, SDU

#### Motivation

Simulation and experimental data

Record dynamics scenario

Summary & Conclusions

- the record dynamics scenario also apples to other non-thermal systems
- simple evolution models (adaptive walks on fitness landscape)

### Outlook

#### ddansk Universit<mark>et</mark>

Numerical experiments on intermittent linear response and spontaneous fluctuations in off-equilibrium aging dynamics

Paolo Sibani IFK, Institut for Fysik og Kemi, SDU

#### Motivation

Simulation and experimental data

Record dynamics scenario

Summary & Conclusions

- the record dynamics scenario also apples to other non-thermal systems
- simple evolution models (adaptive walks on fitness landscape)
- The Tangled Nature model of evolution (based on interactions between individuals)

### Acknowledgments

ddansk Universit<mark>e</mark>

Numerical experiments on intermittent linear response and spontaneous fluctuations in off-equilibrium aging dynamics

Paolo Sibani IFK, Institut for Fysik og Kemi, SDU

Motivation

Simulation and experimental data

Record dynamics scenario

Summary & Conclusions

• Thanks to Jesper Dall, Karl Heinz Hoffmann & Henrik J. Jensen for inputs and discussions .

### Acknowledgments

ddansk Universit<mark>e</mark>i

Numerical experiments on intermittent linear response and spontaneous fluctuations in off-equilibrium aging dynamics

Paolo Sibani IFK, Institut for Fysik og Kemi, SDU

Motivation

Simulation and experimental data

Record dynamics scenario

Summary & Conclusions

- Thanks to Jesper Dall, Karl Heinz Hoffmann & Henrik J. Jensen for inputs and discussions .
- Thanks to the the Danish Center for Super Computing, for computer time on the Horseshoe cluster at SDU

### Acknowledgments

ddansk Universit<mark>e</mark>

Numerical experiments on intermittent linear response and spontaneous fluctuations in off-equilibrium aging dynamics

Paolo Sibani IFK, Institut for Fysik og Kemi, SDU

Motivation

Simulation and experimental data

Record dynamics scenario

Summary & Conclusions

- Thanks to Jesper Dall, Karl Heinz Hoffmann & Henrik J. Jensen for inputs and discussions .
- Thanks to the the Danish Center for Super Computing, for computer time on the Horseshoe cluster at SDU
- The p-model data shown are part of my (former) student, Simon Christiansen's master thesis